

## Annexe 3: Audit Findings Matrix

Audit question 3 : 'To what extent has the government implemented actions for the achievement of the EIPV?'

Audit sub-question 3.1: 'Is there effective coordination, collaboration, and communication between government institutions and entities at different levels for achieving the EIPV?'

Findings					Good practices	Recommendations
Situation found	Criteria <sup>48</sup>	Evidence and analysis	Causes	Effects		
Inadequate horizontal coherence among the institutions involved in the EIPV	<p>UN Resolution A/RES/70/1, paragraphs 17.14, 17.15, 17.16, 17.17,</p> <p>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), art. 3</p> <p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Centre of Government documents</p> <p>National Development Plan</p> <p>Academic articles on coordination, collaboration and coherence in SDGs implementation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interviews with the head of the unit responsible for violence against women in the ministry for women and the head of unit within the ministry for health responsible for women's health shows that there is no coordination between the ministries for health and women. Review of ministry reports and programme documents regarding violence against women, focusing specifically on IPV, shows that interventions do not consider coordination with other agencies.</li> <li>- Interviews with the representative of the centre of government on SDGs and the ministry for women reveals a lack of coordination and collaboration</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Responsible officials of the respective agencies/ ministries didn't analyse the cross-cutting nature of the issue and the need for coordination and collaboration among the agencies</li> <li>- IPV has not been adequately prioritised by the responsible ministries</li> <li>- Agencies do not have the appropriate authority to enforce, and in some cases delegation of authority creates administrative red-tape to coordinate among different ministries</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Agencies are working in silos</li> <li>- There are possible gaps, overlap, fragmentation, and duplication in agencies' efforts to address IPV</li> <li>- Agencies cannot optimally utilise their resources</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To Centre of Government: awareness creation among the agencies on EIPV and on the importance of coordination and collaboration (between the centre of govt. ministries for women, health, justice)</li> <li>- To Centre of Government: resolve the authority and delegation issue between the ministries to have an equal level of participation (centre of govt., ministries for women, health, justice)</li> <li>- Centre of governance, being the focal point, should take the lead in addressing cross-cutting issues with the ministries</li> </ul>	

<sup>48</sup> The criteria would be more or less similar for all findings, but we advise you to identify also national criteria, especially for the findings at local level.

Findings					Good practices	Recommendations
Situation found	Criteria <sup>48</sup>	Evidence and analysis	Causes	Effects		
Good interaction between federal government entities and the CSOs involved in the EIPV	<p>UN Resolution A/RES/70/1, paragraphs 17.14, 17.15, 17.16, 17.17,</p> <p>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), art. 3</p> <p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interviews with representatives of CSOs (UN Women, UNICEF) and ministries for women and health revealed that there are common interests and initiatives from all sides. Also, there are efforts to create synergies within the interventions.</li> <li>- Review of ministry reports and programme documents regarding violence against women, focusing specifically on IPV, shows that interventions do consider the interaction with other agencies.</li> <li>- There are agreements between the ministries and bodies, like the UN Women, UNICEF partnership with the Ministry of Education to include gender issues in the curriculum.</li> <li>- Document review and interview shows that FAO programme is helping to empower rural women through agriculture programmes.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Timely initiatives of the ministry for women, and partnering with the UN bodies</li> <li>- An effective strategy to engage with the CSOs</li> <li>- Proper direction from the centre of government on SDGs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A coordinated effort - albeit with limited resources – results in exemplary engagement with the important actors to address the EIPV issue.</li> </ul>	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To centre of government: Initiatives should continue, and the centre of government may promote the working model to other responsible ministries as good practice to follow.</li> </ul>
Inadequate vertical coherence among the institutions involved in the EIPV	<p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Local Development Plans</p> <p>Academic articles on coordination, collaboration, and coherence in SDGs implementation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interviews with the representative of the centre of government on SDGs and ministry for women and health, state-level administration and local-level administration reveals a lack of coordination and collaboration</li> <li>- Documentation review of the interventions held at the state, local and centre of government level shows a lack of coordination and collaboration between federal and local entities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Lack of communication across the vertical chain due to the lack of delineation and communication of the process</li> <li>- The roles of the respective agencies are not well defined</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- There are possible gaps, overlap, fragmentation, and duplication in agencies' efforts to address the EIPV</li> <li>- Agencies cannot operate optimally</li> </ul>	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To respective ministries: Improved awareness and communication among the different actors across the vertical chain.</li> <li>- To Centre of government: Clearly define roles among the entities</li> </ul>
Lack of engagement of the institutions involved in the EIPV at the local level	<p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interviews with the local unit responsible for EIPV and police stations, health entities, social assistance entities that provide assistance to victims of IPV, schools,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Lack of effective coordination at the local level</li> <li>- Low priority of the issue in the political scenario</li> <li>- Work overload</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Victims not receiving adequate support</li> </ul>	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To Ministry of Women: Enhance local-level resources and capacities to deal with the issue</li> </ul>

Findings					Good practices	Recommendations
Situation found	Criteria <sup>48</sup>	Evidence and analysis	Causes	Effects		
	<p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Local Development Plans</p> <p>Academic articles on coordination, collaboration, and coherence in SDGs implementation</p>	<p>prosecutors, and judges show that there is no coordination between the institutions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Focus group with the local representatives of the CSOs working on the EIPV reveals a lack of coordination and collaboration</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Lack of public trust in the local bodies</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To Ministry of Women: guide local level agencies on how to create coordination mechanisms and engagement with the CSOs</li> </ul>
Lack of coordination, collaboration, and communication between police stations and health entities	<p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Local Development Plans</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Questionnaire to the sample of 50 local police superintendents and ten hospital managers</li> <li>- Interviews shows that, in most cases, there is a lack of coordination between the relevant hospital and the police with respect to activities related to EIPV</li> <li>- An analysis of the hospital system to determine whether it has an appropriate method to identify and document IPV cases shows that generally it doesn't report such cases as IPV cases</li> <li>- Interviews with police and health officials show that they don't coordinate their work to facilitate assistance to the victims</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Both hospital and police sources indicate their lack of capacity to address such issues and the need for additional resources</li> <li>- There is lack of adequate data from the police and hospital on such cases to allow for the appropriate measurement of the situation on the ground</li> <li>- There is no formal communication channel established between the police and hospitals</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Victims' cases and information remain unrecorded and unaddressed, which hides the extent of the problem</li> <li>- Less data reliability of the issue</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The secretary of women in state X developed and installed a system within the hospitals that allows for the registration of all cases of IPV and the automatic notification to the police department</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To the ministry for women to guide the agencies on states and municipalities to: enhance capacity by providing resources, if possible, and to engage local CSOs to help assist and coordinate</li> <li>- Improve data collection and database maintenance in both police stations and hospitals</li> </ul>
Lack of coordination, collaboration, and communication between police stations, prosecutors and judges	<p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Local Development Plans</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interview with the local police chief, with local public prosecutors, and with judges revealed there is insufficient communication and coordination between the parties on the EIPV</li> <li>- An analysis of the process and the documentation review show that there is often a delay in the time taken by the police to send the information on the incidents to the</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- At the local level, the police, prosecutors and judges are not familiar with the concept of coordination on issues like EIPV and that such coordination will benefit the victims</li> <li>- The police workforce is overwhelmed with law enforcement and this hinders timely reporting</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Agencies work in silos</li> <li>- There is an information and data gap</li> <li>- There is a risk that victims suffer new episodes of violence</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- To the Ministry of Justice: sensitise the police, prosecutors, and Judges on the EIPV and promote relevant good practices</li> <li>- Organise work allocation of the police in such a way that it will not hamper their regular work</li> </ul>

Findings					Good practices	Recommendations
Situation found	Criteria <sup>48</sup>	Evidence and analysis	Causes	Effects		
		<p>judges; as a result, the victims may face social exclusion, trauma, new episodes of violence and, in extreme cases, even murder</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In a few serious cases, judges put a restriction on the perpetrators, but due to lack of capacity, the police cannot enforce the judges' ruling</li> </ul>				
Lack of coordination, collaboration, and communication between health entities and social welfare agencies (who attends victims of IPV)	<p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Local Development Plans</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interviews with manager of health entities revealed there is insufficient communication and coordination between them and the social welfare agencies on EIPV</li> <li>- A focus group with managers of social welfare entities revealed that they don't have the required process in place and contacts with health service when it comes to the EIPV</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Health service don't have psychologists</li> <li>- Health services providers are not aware of what to do in cases of IPV and lack awareness that that they could send the victim to social welfare agencies for assistance and treatment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- There is confusion among the social welfare and health services, leading women to health care instead of social care, which represents the primary need for the women</li> </ul>	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Make an assessment of the need for psychologists</li> <li>- To the ministries of health and social welfare to guide state and local health and social welfare agencies to define roles and responsibilities, and to coordinate and collaborate on activities related to EIPV</li> </ul>
Good engagement between the local entity responsible for EIPV and local CSOs that work with EIPV	<p>Commission on the Status of Women (CSW 60/2016/25)</p> <p>ONU Women. 2014. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming - Guidance Note</p> <p>Istanbul convention, art. 7 and 10</p> <p>Local Development Plans</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Interviews have indicated that that there are common initiatives being undertaken by different parties, and synergies have been established</li> <li>- A documentation review and interviews show effective engagements between the ministry and International bodies, such as UN Women</li> <li>- Following the federal orientation, local agencies also have been coordinating and collaborating, to address gender issues in schools and facilitate initiatives to empower rural women</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Initiatives by the ministry for women, as they approach UN bodies</li> <li>- Engagement with CSOs are effective</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Coordinated efforts with limited resources to address EIPV, benefiting victims</li> </ul>	-	-